*English Instructional Plan – Crowd Sourcing False Premise Analysis and Rewriting for Clarity*

**Primary Strand: 11.5 & 12.5 Reading**

**Integrated Strand/s: 11.1, 11.2 & 12.1, 12.2 Communication and Multimodal Literacy, 11.6, 12.6 Writing**

**Essential Understanding:**

· understand how to analyze informational material

· understand a variety of persuasive techniques and rhetorical devices

· recognize the text structure of informational and technical writing

· understand how format and style in informational text differ from those in narrative and expository text

· understand that writing should be purposefully crafted with attention to deliberate word choice, precise information, and vocabulary

· understand the importance of evaluating the intent of the author, which may include misinformation, bias, and unsupported assertions

**Essential Knowledge, Skills, and Processes:**

* analyze and use a variety of persuasive techniques and rhetorical devices, including, but not limited to,
	+ ethos
	+ pathos
	+ logos
	+ claims/counterclaims
	+ false premises
* identify how authors use rhetorical devices to create ethos, pathos, and logos
* analyze information from multiple texts to make inferences and draw conclusions
* compare and contrast how complex texts treat the same topics
* analyze how a variety of logical arguments could reach conflicting conclusions
* evaluate the relevance and quality of evidence used to support a claim and address a counterclaim
* analyze and identify false premises that intentionally manipulate audience
* demonstrate the purpose of writing as persuasive/argumentative
* refine the thesis by considering whether the claim is logical and meaningful, and whether it expresses the writer’s position in an argument
* write persuasively/argumentatively, organizing reasons logically and effectively
* analyze sources and determine the best information to support a position/argument
* use credible, current research and expert opinions to support a position/argument
* compare/contrast and select evidence from multiple texts to strengthen a position/argument
* anticipate and address counterevidence, counterclaims, and counterargument
* introduce claim(s), acknowledge and distinguish claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims
* identify valid main and supporting ideas in various sources and distinguish them from misconceptions and biased points of view when information conflicts
* synthesize information in a logical sequence
* incorporate ideas and quotations skillfully by directly quoting, paraphrasing, or summarizing text from reliable sources and citing them appropriately.

**Primary SOL:** 11.5g, 12.5e Analyze false premises, claims, counterclaims, and other evidence in persuasive writing.

11.6b, 12.6b Produce argument in writing developing a thesis that demonstrates knowledgeable judgements, addresses counterclaims, and provides effective conclusions.

11.8b Make sense of information gathered from diverse sources by identifying misconceptions, main and supporting ideas, conflicting information, point of view or bias.

**Reinforced (Related Standard) SOL:**

11.2, 12.2 The student will examine how values and points of view are included or excluded and how media influences beliefs and behaviors.

11.6c Organize claims, counterclaims, and evidence in a sustained and logical sequence.

12.6c Use a variety of rhetorical strategies to clarify and defend a position organizing claims, counterclaims, and evidence in a sustained and logical sequence.

## **Materials**

* White boards OR posters
* Computer/Technology Access
* Capability to set up desks/tables in to stations
* Document set up for note-taking

##

## **Student/Teacher Actions: What should students be doing? What should teachers be doing?**

Length: Multiple Day Lesson

This lesson can be used to build upon understanding and applying persuasive techniques. Students should have a solid understanding of ethos, pathos, and logos before this lesson.

1. Introduce this lesson by reviewing why persuasion is used and how effective techniques such as ethos, pathos, and logos are used. The teacher will put a chart on the board with the headings: ethos, pathos, and logos. Students should define each of these terms in simple wording and give a real-world example. Teacher can write it on the board as class discussion takes place, or have students write them on the board.

2. Once prior knowledge is activated, pose the question: “Can persuasion cause arguments? Why or why not?” Guide the class discussion to identify persuasive techniques are not always based on the truth because people draw their own *conclusions* based on their own experiences. Discuss how society sees ethos, pathos, logos used a lot in advertising. Example: Scare tactic--An advertisement can say: “Without this additional insurance, you could find yourself broke and homeless.” Review what persuasive technique is being used [Pathos], and then ask if the class if this statement is TRUE in all circumstances. Locating ads to demonstrate this on YouTube or other online sources would supplement this discussion. This discussion should lead to the introduction of false premise. Teacher will instruct the class on a new term—false premise.

3. Teacher will present a mini-lesson about false premise that will begin with the definition of the term premise and include sharing of real life examples of false premises from the media. [This lesson from a Virginia English teacher is also effective](https://prezi.com/ud5w0cn2whys/false-premise/).Students will need to participate in discussion, take notes, and understand the concept of false premise. Teacher will reinforce that premise means assumption or proposition. Then, give examples of false premises:

a. “We’re bound to have a winning team this year. Five of our starters are back.”

 i. Premise = experience ensures skill and success [this is not entirely true]

 ii. Flaw = players may be mediocre

b. “If streets are wet, it has rained recently.”

 i. Flaws = river could have flooded, someone hosed down the street, street cleaners, etc.

To conclude mini-lesson, the teacher can say, “Arguments can be logically valid, but not always true. For this reason, arguments based on false premise are more difficult to refute or even discuss because the truth of a premise must be agreed upon by all parties.”

**Activity**

Once students have a clear grasp on false premise definition and examples, work on identifying and applying skills with the concept.

1. Teacher will divide students into groups and set the classroom up to accommodate group stations. One member from each group will move around the room to different stations. There should be at least 3-4 students in a group. Group members need to decide roles: leader, investigator, and reporter.

 i. Leader = Role is to facilitate the group, float between stations to monitor his/her group’s false premise and listen to conversations at other tables. Leaders will move around to other groups and help his/her own group when needed to answer questions/monitor conversation. Helping role.

 ii. Investigator = Role is to assist **other** groups by asking questions or giving opinions to prove their premise is false. Tell them why the conclusion drawn is false or does not apply to everyone. Talking role.

 iii. Reporter = Role is to stay at his/her group’s station and take notes about what others comment or question about your premise. Note should include two columns with truths and flaws. Write down questions and comments. Listening role.

*2.* Once students have moved into groups, the teacher will instruct students to choose one topic they are passionate about that is related to politics, education, community, school, etc. Once the group has decided on a topic, students will use technology to find a false premise related to their topic. It should be one statement that is pulled from an advertisement, newspaper article, or opinion piece. Teacher should remind students that this may be hard because they are pulling a statement that may seem true to them. EXAMPLE: *Schools teach students to persevere and stay positive.*

3. Students need to create an MLA or APA citation for the source where they found the false premise. \*This step may be skipped if you have not covered research skills.

4. Students will write the false premise they have found on a board (computer screen, poster, white board) that allows the other classmates to see it at their station.

5. Teacher will inform students that the investigators will visit with three different stations for two minutes each. The reporter can only ask questions for clarification but their primary role is to listen. Leaders can decide where to assist their group; however, reporters may need the most help with notes.

6. Students will participate in activity while teacher will time and go around the room to observe.

7. When the time is up, students should go back to their original groups to look at notes about their premise. Each group should work together by highlighting similar questions and comments about their premise. Once each group identifies common trends in notes, students will rewrite their premise based on what they have gathered and believe is true and valid.

8. Each group will present their boards to the class starting with the original false premise; discuss what common trends they found during the investigation, and end with their rewritten premise they believe to be true. Each group member should take a role in presenting information for report out to class.

Closure: Teacher will ask students to reflect on activity and false premises. Each student will answer the following questions to turn in: Was it easy or difficult to find a false premise and explain why. Do they feel like the rewritten premise is true and valid? Why or why not?

**Assessment**

· During mini-lesson, poll students for understanding check points and ask for examples to establish real world connections.

· Teacher monitors progress during station work to confer with students to clarify misunderstandings.

· Students writing response for closure of lesson should be turned in to monitor comprehension.

**Writing Connection**

· A reciprocal lesson in thesis statements and/or speech writing can take place based off the group’s rewritten premises. Teacher can point out the importance of phrases and specific wording in persuasive/argumentative writing such as the need to include *some* or *most*, and verbs to make statements more valid.

**Extensions and Connections (for all students)**

* Following lesson, teacher can dig into fallacy definitions: ad hominem, red herring, straw man, begging the question. Identifying worksheet is attached at attachment A.
* Summative Assessment: Group presentations or persuasive speeches. Persuasive speeches can include work from activity and expand on specific techniques [ethos, pathos, logos], OR format formal debate to expand on argumentative.
* Students should use research to expand on validity and logos in speech for claims.
* Teacher has the opportunity to explain the difference in writing between speech and essay. Students have established an idea of audience’s opinions by work during activity.
* Students can look at two premises from two conflicting sides about the same topic to discuss the purpose/motivation for each.

**Strategies for Differentiation**

· Create false premise presentation for students who may need a visual reminder and copy of notes.

· Students can work in groups to provide English Learners with a model of language and help with comprehension.

· Teacher can work with students individually during activity to guide understanding and model roles.

· Teacher can assign groups based on ability to provide more support in each group.

· Teacher may preselect false premise examples and provide handouts with written explanations.

· Teacher can provide written instructions for activity and read them aloud to class.

· Teacher can show students two premises from two conflicting sides about the same topic to discuss the purpose/motivation for each

**Attachment A**

**Practice False Reasoning**

*Identify the false reasoning used for each of the following. Choose from red herring, ad hominem, begging the question, or straw man. Each will be used once.*

1. The government doesn't take care of the poor because it doesn't have a tax specifically to support the poor.
2. I know your car isn't working right, but if you had gone to the store one day earlier, you would not be having problems.
3. Tobacco has been shown to be as addictive as heroin and thus should be treated as a dangerous drug.
4. Green Peace's strategies aren't effective because they are all hippies.