**Primary Strand:** 10.6 Writing

**Integrated Strand/s:**

10.1.g: Respond thoughtfully and tactfully to diverse perspectives, summarizing points of agreement and disagreement.  
10.1h: Choose vocabulary, language, and tone appropriate to the topic, audience, and purpose.  
10.5b: Recognize an author’s intended audience and purpose for writing.  
10.5g: Analyze and synthesize information in order to solve problems, answer questions, and generate new knowledge.  
10.8b: Analyze information gathered from diverse sources by identifying misconceptions, main and supporting ideas, conflicting information, and point of view or bias.

**Essential Understanding:**

All students should:

* blend multiple forms of writing, including embedding a narrative to produce effective essays.
* understand that writing should be purposefully crafted with attention to deliberate word choice and precise information
* understand the importance of evaluating the intent of the author, which may include misinformation, bias, and unsupported assertions

**Essential Knowledge, Skills, and Processes:**

To be successful with this standard, students are expected to:

* develop and apply embedded narrative techniques, such as dialogue, description, and pacing to develop experiences or characters and enhance writing
* analyze sources and determine the best information to support position/argument
* use credible, current research and expert opinions to support a position/argument
* compare/contrast and select evidence from multiple texts to strengthen a position/argument
* revise writing for clarity and quality of information to effectively match the intended audience and purpose of a workplace and/or postsecondary education
* develop ideas deductively and inductively and organize ideas in a logical sequence, applying the effective organizational patterns/techniques

**Primary SOL:**.

10.6 j: Blend multiple forms of writing, including embedding a narrative to produce effective essays.

**Reinforced (Related Standard) SOL:**

10.1j: Use reflection to evaluate one's own role and the group process in small-group activities.

10.5d: Compare and contrast informational texts for intent and content.

10.5f: Draw conclusions and make inferences on explicit and implied information, using textual support as evidence.

10.5g: Analyze and synthesize information in order to solve problems, answer questions, and generate new knowledge.

## Materials

* Venn Diagram Graphic Organizer [(ReadWriteThink](https://www.readwritethink.org/classroom-resources/student-interactives/venn-diagram))
* Reflection Questions for Analysis Essays ([ReadingWriteThink](https://www.readwritethink.org/sites/default/files/resources/lesson_images/lesson800/RevisionGuides.pdf))
* [Cultural Analysis Graphic Organizer](https://docs.google.com/document/d/1XSU4MsILRNAkCuHqVL_oikauXVuPA5-m6gMhFcDIMWQ/copy)
* A list of cultural objects/messages/art forms students can analyze
* Mentor Texts/Mentor Text Sets ([Mentor Text Dropbox from *Moving Writers* Blog](https://movingwriters.org/professional-development-2/mentor-text-dropbox-project/))

## Student/Teacher Actions: What should students be doing? What should teachers be doing?

**Session 1:**

**Activating Prior Knowledge:**

1. Ask students to work with a shoulder partner to generate a list of "high art" (opera, Shakespeare in the Park, classical music, poetry) and "low/popular art" (movies, graffiti, slam poetry, gaming).
2. Ask students to review the lists and discuss the similarities and differences between the two lists. What value does each give to our daily lives? Why is low/popular art valuable to our lives?

**Explicit Instruction:**

1. Tell students that they are going to look for signs that are around them each day. Push the discussion from tangible signs (like road signs) to more intangible signs (like the ways people choose to dress as a sign to the outside world). Ask students to create a class definition of sign.
2. Tell students that signs are around us each day, and as consumers we are bombarded with messages, both implicit and explicit. Using a school clock as an example, ask students to analyze the school clock as a sign. Drive the discussion using the questions below. Record student answers.
3. a. What things or people is this object associated with?

b. What systems is this object a part of?

c. How is this object different or the same as other models/types/styles?

d. Is this object part of a pattern? What other objects are like it?

e. Ask students why this object is built/used/or structured the way it is.

1. Students should make generalizations about the object based on the specific

information discussed. Students should be able to comment about how this object   
 could be a sign of certain expectations, structures, etc.

1. Remind students that analyzing this cultural object helps unpack a more in-depth   
    analysis and the bigger picture of the use of and meaning behind objects people   
    encounter every day.

7. Define with students a common vocabulary about these terms: cultural practices,   
 cultural developments, and cultural objects. Suggested definitions are below.

*a. Cultural Practices: Ways people in a given culture do things.  
 b. Cultural Developments: Changes or trends in a culture.*

*c. Cultural objects: Single objects that belong to a larger cultural practice.*

**Guided Practice**:

1. In pairs or in small groups, students generate a list of three cultural objects and unpack the meaning of these objects.
2. Students should discuss the following questions and answer in their groups:
3. What things or people is this object associated with?
4. What systems is this object a part of?
5. How is this object different or the same as other models/types/styles?
6. Is this object part of a pattern? What other objects are like it?
7. Why is the object built/used/or structured the way it is?

**Independent Practice:**

1. Students complete the list and analysis in their groups.
2. Students present their objects and analysis to the class. This can be done through a presentation medium.

**Session 2:**

**Activating Prior Knowledge:**

1. Distribute mentor text sets to students.
2. Ask students to choose texts based on their knowledge.
3. Discuss with students the differences between the broad categories of mentor texts and the specific categories that will create strong mentor texts.
4. Reflecting on the text sets students chose, ask them to define what makes their text set specific and appropriate for analysis. Discuss.

**Explicit Instruction:**

1. Using a mentor text set example, show students how to find texts to add to the set.

**Guided Practice:**

1. Students find their own mentor texts that relate to the theme of their set. Assist students as necessary.

**Independent Practice:**

1. Students complete their mentor text set independently.

**Session 3:**

**Activating Prior Knowledge:**

1. Distribute an article from a mentor text to students.
2. With students, read the mentor text and model answering the following questions:
   1. What things or people is this topic associated with?
   2. What systems is this topic a part of?
   3. How is this topic related to modern life?
   4. Is this topic part of a pattern? How?
   5. Why is the topic important?
3. Model close reading and returning to the text to support your rationale.

**Guided Practice**

1. Distribute a related mentor text to students and in pairs or small groups, they read the text and proceed through the same process as in the **Activating Prior Knowledge** section.
2. Students should answer the following questions:
   1. What things or people is this topic associated with?
   2. What systems is this topic a part of?
   3. How is this topic related to modern life?
   4. Is this topic part of a pattern? How?
   5. Why is the topic important?
3. Students report out to the full class by providing a brief summary of the article and then responses to the questions.

**Independent Practice:**

1. Students should use their personal mentor text set and begin applying close reading strategies.
2. Students will answer the following questions:
   1. What things or people is this topic associated with?
   2. What systems is this topic a part of?
   3. How is this topic related to modern life?
   4. Is this topic part of a pattern? How?
   5. Why is the topic important?
3. As students work, assist as needed, and ask students questions to help them gain a deeper understanding of the text.

**Assessment :**Students should use the Cultural Analysis Graphic Organizer to help them formulate their thoughts. Once students have completed the independent practice, students will use it to frame their class discussion. One idea would be to give pairs of students with similar interests the same article and have them independently analyze it and then discuss the similarities and differences in their analysis . Students should engage in a reflective activity using questions from the “Reflection Questions for Analysis Essays” to determine the depth of their analysis. Ask students to reflect on if their interests have deepened or changed based on their analysis. Students could be evaluated on their ability to embed the narrative into their analysis.

**Writing Connections:**

* Students are working towards an analysis of a cultural phenomenon based on their topic of interest. The culminating assessment will be an analysis to the following prompt:

*Consider one of the following from the mentor text set you read: a cultural practice, a cultural development, or a cultural object. Explain what this practice/development/object means about the culture’s value or belief system. How does this practice/development/object reflect the cultural morals, fears, desires, insecurities, needs, expectations, strengths or weaknesses of the culture? What is the significance?*

**Extensions and Connections (for all students)**

* Provide students with analysis texts that embed the narrative and have them respond to the author about the quality of the analysis.
* Using the same article, students can participate in a Gallery Walk and identify lines from the article that they find relevant and lines that are off-topic and debate their choices in a group setting.
* Students can participate in a Socratic Seminar about the relevance of the author’s analysis to audiences of the future.

**Strategies for Differentiation**

* Provide graphic organizers to help students generate ideas with a bank of suggestions to get them started.
* Similarly, teachers can provide sentence or paragraph stems and transition words to help students transition from their graphic organizer to their essays.
* Provide a single-point rubric before students begin writing, so they understand the criteria and expectations in advance.
* Model an exemplary paragraph or sentence as the teacher, and break down your thinking for the students. Why did you pick that transition or that phrase? Why did you erase one word and replace it with another?
* Share examples of exemplary student samples with the class once the student writer has explicitly given permission. This provides more samples and examples that can help generate a new idea.
* Feedback, feedback, feedback! Provide as much feedback as possible along the way to support student writers.

**Primary Strand:** 11.6 Writing

**Integrated Strand/s:**

* 11.1 d) Respond thoughtfully and tactfully to diverse perspectives, summarizing points of agreement and disagreement.
* 11.1 e) Use a variety of strategies to listen actively and speak using appropriate discussion rules with awareness of verbal and nonverbal cues.
* 11.1 f) Anticipate and address alternative or opposing perspectives and counterclaims.
* 11.5 d) Paraphrase and synthesize ideas within and between texts.
* 11.5 f) Analyze multiple texts addressing the same topic to determine how authors reach similar or different conclusions.
* 11.8 a) Critically evaluate quality, accuracy, and validity of information.

**Essential Understanding:**

All students should:

* understand how persuasive appeals (i.e. ethos, pathos, & logos) add evidence to a claim,
* engage in classroom discussions on a topic to better understand various perspectives,
* analyze a variety of sources to determine and support a claim, and
* blend multiple forms of writing, including embedding a narrative to produce effective argumentative essays.

**Essential Knowledge, Skills, and Processes:**

To be successful with these standards, students are expected to:

* develop and apply embedded narrative techniques, such as dialogue, description, and pacing to develop experiences or characters and enhance writing,
* analyze sources and determine the best information to support a position/argument,
* use credible, current research and expert opinions to support a position/argument,
* compare/contrast and select evidence from multiple texts to strengthen a position/argument,
* revise writing for clarity and quality of information to effectively match the intended audience and purpose of a workplace and/or postsecondary education, and
* develop ideas deductively and inductively and organize ideas in a logical sequence, applying the effective organizational patterns/techniques.

**Primary SOL:**.

11.6 f: Blend multiple forms of writing, including embedding a narrative to produce effective essays.

**Reinforced (Related Standard) SOL:**

* 11.1 d) Respond thoughtfully and tactfully to diverse perspectives, summarizing points of agreement and disagreement.
* 11.1 f) Anticipate and address alternative or opposing perspectives and counterclaims.
* 11.5 f) Analyze multiple texts addressing the same topic to determine how authors reach similar or different conclusions.
* 11.8 a) Critically evaluate quality, accuracy, and validity of information.

## Materials

* Instructional Materials:
  + Argument or Persuasion by [ReadWriteThink (Graphic Organizer](https://www.readwritethink.org/sites/default/files/resources/lesson-docs/Difference_Between_Persuasive_Argumentative.pdf))
  + “Discussion Web” by [ReadWriteThink (Graphic Organizer)](https://www.readwritethink.org/sites/default/files/resources/lesson_images/lesson819/graphic-organizer.pdf)
  + “Developing Evidence-based Arguments from Texts” by [ReadWriteThink (Strategy Guide)](https://www.readwritethink.org/professional-development/strategy-guides/developing-evidence-based-arguments)
  + “Evidence-based Argument Checklist” by [ReadWriteThink (Checklist)](https://www.readwritethink.org/sites/default/files/resources/lesson-docs/EBAChecklist.pdf)
* Mentor texts for thematic text set
  + Visuals
    - “Voice of Fire” by Barnett Newman, painting, 1967
    - “Red Composition” by Jackson Pollock, painting, 1946
    - “Umbrella Girl” by Banksy, street art, 2008
    - “Why is this art? Andy Warhol, Campbell’s Soup Cans” by Khan Academy ([Video](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SdbOrNLcC0I)), 2012
  + Nonfiction
    - “Do we need art in our lives?” by Michael Gonchar, *The Learning Network (The New York Times)*, 2013.
    - [“Second Banksy vandalized: 2008 ‘Umbrella Girl’ painting by the graffiti master attacked”](https://www.nola.com/entertainment_life/arts/article_05c4ff18-4852-11eb-bdd3-032ae46afdd9.html) by Dough Maccash, *NOLA*, 2020.
    - “[Why we make art: Seven artists explain why they write, rap, take photos, draw, dance, and make movies](https://greatergood.berkeley.edu/article/item/why_we_make_art)” by Jeremy Adam Smith & Jason Marsh, *Greater Good Magazine*, 2008.
    - [“Feeling artsy? Here’s how making art helps your brain”](https://www.npr.org/sections/health-shots/2020/01/11/795010044/feeling-artsy-heres-how-making-art-helps-your-brain) by Malaka Gharib, *NPR*, 2020.

## Student/Teacher Actions: What should students be doing? What should teachers be doing?

**Session 1:**

**Activating Prior Knowledge:**

1. Using the four visuals, the teacher will create a gallery walk. Students will review each piece of art, trying to answer the question, “Is this art? Why or why not?”
2. Teachers may provide a graphic organizer for students to write their notes, but students should not discuss their notes with other students.
3. After 5-7 minutes, the teacher should have students share out their decision for each visual. Students should be engaged and pushed to really have to justify and define “art.”

**Explicit Instruction**

1. The teacher should facilitate a dialogue in which students discuss the elements of a narrative. “What makes a story a story?” “Why is a story important to an argument?” “Why do we value stories?” This allows students the opportunity to focus on defining a narrative.
2. The teacher will share the article “Why we make art” to share how a person’s narrative adds credibility (ethos) to an argument. After reading the introduction together, students should discuss the article’s claim.
3. Then, the teacher can use one of the narratives as a model for how the narrative is being used to support the argument that art gives meaning to our lives. Students will annotate for the narrative techniques the author uses, highlighting dialogue, setting, characterization, conflict, etc. The teacher will facilitate students through a class discussion via the discussion web to determine how well the narrative supports the article’s claim.

**Guided Practice**

1. If students are interested in digging deeper, they can watch the Khan Academy video, which highlights Andy Warhol’s works as another concrete example for this argument. A video with captions might engage more students in thinking about their argument.
2. Then, students can select their own artist from the remaining six; they should complete a similar annotation to identify narrative techniques.
3. After an ample amount of reading time, students could form groups by artist selection to discuss their analysis and observations. Once identified, students should analyze how the narrative supports or fails to the article’s argument.

**Independent Practice**

1. The teacher could provide the remaining articles for students to select one to read that most interest them.
2. For a third time, students are encouraged to both identify and analyze the narrative techniques.

**Session 2:**

**Explicit Instruction**

1. The teacher will teach the Claim-Evidence-Reasoning (CER) strategy to explain a foundational writing strategy for argumentative writing. Teachers could use [one of these pre-made samples](https://www.readwritethink.org/professional-development/strategy-guides/developing-evidence-based-arguments) from ReadWriteThink, extend the text set from Session 1, or add their own examples to model CER via samples. Students will practice one of the mini-writing sessions involved in the CER process.
2. The teacher will model using [this template](https://www.readwritethink.org/sites/default/files/resources/lesson-docs/MakingEBArgument.pdf) from ReadWriteThink to create Evidence-Based Arguments to argue a claim based on Session 1’s question: “Do we need art in our lives?” The teacher should model incorporating a narrative from one of the texts from the mentor text to showcase how it’s used as evidence for the claim.
3. The teacher will model using the template to write a Claim-Evidence-Reasoning paragraph for the students; students can suggest ideas to help the teacher’s writing come to life, too.

**Guided Practice**

1. In partners, students will brainstorm a second claim. Using the same template, they will locate evidence to support their argument.
2. As partners, students will write one paragraph practice using the template to write a well-constructed argument. Similarly, students should use a narrative as one piece of evidence for their claim.
3. The teacher will conduct mini-writing conferences as students are writing to generate an abundance of feedback.

**Independent Practice**

1. Each student will deepen either the teacher’s argument or their argument with their partner by adding another paragraph. But, this activity will be completed independently, *and* the student should include a new narrative example.
2. The narrative could be a personal example, pulled from the class reading, or independently located.

**Assessment:** Students should use the “discussion web” in a debate. Once students have completed the independent practice, students will use their “discussion web” in a classroom debate. One idea would be to show students an appropriate image/visual/song and have them debate if the image is art. This would conclude the cycle from the beginning of the day’s lesson. Students should engage in a reflective activity to determine if they feel the same or different after the day’s lesson. Ask students to isolate a moment that their minds were changed--was narrative a contributing factor? Another variation could be to debate over the question “Do we need art in our lives?” Students have read, watched, and analyzed in preparation to form arguments for this discussion. Students could be evaluated on their ability to support their claim with strong and convincing evidence, especially ones that utilize a narrative.

**Writing Connections:** Students are preparing to ultimately write to the prompt: “Choose a current topic evident in the media (e.g. political cartoons, editorials, newspapers, news magazines, social media etc.) Find pieces of media literacy with opposing points of view on the topic. Write an analysis of the varying media messages. Argue as to which media message/platform presented the most objective perspective of the event. A multimodal presentation exhibiting the various viewpoints and media platforms would enhance students’ understanding.” This lesson helps students build the foundational argumentative skills necessary to apply these skills to a new task.

**Extensions and Connections (for all students)**

Writing Sprints: give students a topic and allow them to brainstorm or write about the topic for one minute. Then, provide a new question, and restart the timer. While time can add some anxiety, the goal is for students to quickly start to generate ideas that they can revise later.

Quote Match: Provide three visuals and three quotes for students. Have them match a quote with the visual. Then, have them select one match and write a claim-evidence-reasoning paragraph arguing how the quote matches the text. Even better? Provide a song title with an acoustic or instrumental song. Students could complete the same exercise.

**Strategies for Differentiation**

* Provide graphic organizers to help student generate ideas with a bank of suggestions to get them started.
* Similarly, teachers can provide sentence or paragraph stems and transition words to help students transition from their graphic organizer to their essays.
* Provide a single-point rubric before students begin writing, so they understand the criteria and expectations in advance.
* Model an exemplary paragraph or sentence as the teacher, and break down your thinking for the students. Why did you pick that transition or that phrase? Why did you erase one word and replace it with another?
* Share examples of exemplary student samples with the class once the student writer has explicitly given permission. This provides more samples and examples that can help generate a new idea.
* Feedback, feedback, feedback! Provide as much feedback as possible along the way to support student writers.